Satiated relative permeability of variable-aperture fractures

Russell L. Detwiler  
Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, University of California, 7000 East Avenue, Livermore, California 94551, USA

Harihar Rajaram  
Department of Civil, Environmental and Architectural Engineering, University of Colorado, 428 UCB, Boulder, Colorado 80309, USA

Robert J. Glass  
Flow Visualization and Processes Laboratory, Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87185, USA
(Received 9 July 2004; revised manuscript received 27 December 2004; published 28 March 2005)

Experimental studies of capillary-dominated displacements in variable-aperture fractures have demonstrated the occurrence of a satiated state at the end of invasion, where significant entrapment of the displaced phase occurs. The structure of this entrapped phase controls the behavior of flow and transport processes in the flowing phase. Recent studies have shown that the areal saturation of the flowing phase at satiation ($S_f$) is largely controlled by a single parameter $C/\delta$, where $C$, the curvature number, weighs the mean in-plane interfacial curvature relative to the mean out-of-plane interfacial curvature, and $\delta$, the coefficient of variation of the aperture field, represents the strength of interface roughening induced by aperture variations. Here we consider the satiated relative permeability ($k_{rs}$) to the flowing phase, which is defined as the relative permeability when the defending phase is fully entrapped. The satiated relative permeability is shown to be a well-defined function of $S_f$ over a wide range of $C/\delta$, ranging from capillary fingering with significant entrapment ($C/\delta \rightarrow 0$) to smooth invasion with very little entrapment ($C/\delta > 1$). We develop a relationship for $k_{rs}$ as a function of $S_f$, by combining theoretical results for the effective permeability in a spatially correlated random permeability field, with results from continuum percolation theory for quantifying the influence of the entrapped phase. The resulting model for $k_{rs}$ also involves a dependence on $\delta$. The predicted relative permeability values are accurate across the entire range of phase structures representative of capillary-dominated displacements in variable-aperture fractures.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevE.71.031114  PACS number(s): 46.65.+g, 47.55.Mh, 47.55.Kf, 47.54.+r

I. INTRODUCTION

The presence of two or more fluids within a fracture reduces the permeability to each phase [1–4]. This reduction in permeability is often represented by the relative permeability, which is the ratio of the permeability in two-phase flow to that in single-phase flow and varies between 0 and 1. Experiments and simulations have demonstrated that capillary-dominated displacements (i.e., negligible gravity and viscous forces) in statistically homogeneous variable-aperture fractures can result in a satiated condition in which the invading phase spans the fracture and the defending phase is completely entrapped [5–7]. The satiated state corresponds to the end of invasion (analogous to the second percolation threshold or trapping threshold defined by Wilkinson and Willemsen [5]), unlike the invasion percolation threshold, which corresponds to first breakthrough and spanning of the domain by the invading phase. The satiated state is established over relatively short time scales [6] and can persist within a variable-aperture fracture for a very long duration, unless disturbed by external forces [8] or dissolution of the entrapped phase [9,10]. The flow and transport properties corresponding to the satiated state are thus important to a variety of applied problems. In this paper, our objective is to develop a model for predicting the relative permeability under satiated conditions.

The satiated relative permeability ($k_{rs}$) is controlled by the geometry of the flowing phase at satiation, which is defined by the configuration of entrapped regions and the aperture variability induced by fracture surface roughness. During invasion, small perturbations in capillary forces along the invading interface, caused by local perturbations in interfacial curvature, lead to roughening of the interface and entrapment of the defending phase. The magnitude of interface roughening and the geometry of the resulting entrapped phase are controlled by aperture variability within the fracture and the contact angle between the invading and defending fluids at the rock surfaces. Invasion percolation (IP) algorithms, which have been widely used to simulate immiscible displacements in porous media [5,11,12] and fractures [13,14], sequentially fill sites with the largest value of

$$P_c = \frac{1}{\Omega} \left( \frac{1}{r_1} + \frac{1}{r_2} \right)$$

along the invading interface, where $r_1$ and $r_2$ are the two principal radii of interfacial curvature and $\Omega$ is the interfacial tension. In porous media, Eq. (1) is typically applied by assuming $r_1$ and $r_2$ are equal and proportional to the pore radius. In fractures, $r_1$ is measured orthogonal to the mean fracture plane (Fig. 1). Because $r_2$ is typically much larger than $r_1$, $r_2$ is often considered insignificant in determining invasion orders [13,14]. However, recent experimental studies [6] have demonstrated that in-plane interfacial curvature can lead to significant smoothing of interfaces. As a result,
phase geometries in two-phase flow through fractures can deviate significantly from the behavior predicted by IP algorithms.

A modified invasion percolation algorithm (MIP) that accounts explicitly for both \( r_f \) and \( r_g \) reproduces experimentally observed phase geometries better than IP [6]. For each iteration of the MIP algorithm, \( P_c \) is calculated at each location along the invading interface using Fig. 1: \( r_1 = a/2 \cos(\alpha + \beta) \) and \( r_2 = (\lambda/2)\tan(\gamma/2) \), where \( a \) is the local fracture aperture, \( \alpha \) is the fluid-fluid contact angle at the rock surfaces, \( \beta \) is the convergence-divergence angle of the opposing rock surfaces, \( \gamma \) is the included angle between two vectors that approximate the local interface from the invading fluid side, and \( \lambda \) is the correlation length of the variable aperture field; \( \lambda/2 \) is used here as a characteristic in-plane radius of curvature within a spatially correlated field. For small values of \( \beta \) and uniform \( \alpha \) near 0 or \( \pi \), we can neglect \( \beta \) and nondimensionalize Eq. (1) in terms of the parameter \( C = \langle a \rangle / (\lambda \cos \alpha) \):

\[
P_c^* = \frac{1}{r_1^*} + \frac{1}{r_2^*},
\]

where the asterisk represents dimensionless variables (see Glass et al. [6] for details). In Eq. (2), \( C \) weighs the relative influences of mean in-plane and out-of-plane interfacial curvatures.

Recent theoretical and computational results based on MIP [15] demonstrate that a simple measure of the flowing phase structure at saturation, the areal saturation \( S_f \), depends strongly on the ratio of \( C \) and \( \delta = \sigma_a / \langle a \rangle \), where \( \langle a \rangle \) is the mean and \( \sigma_a \) the standard deviation of the aperture field, respectively. Thus, for any capillary-dominated invasion process in which values of \( \langle a \rangle \), \( \sigma_a \), \( \lambda \), and \( \alpha \) yield the same value of \( C/\delta \), the resulting entrapped-flowing phase structures will be similar. Effectively, \( C \) measures the strength of smoothing at the invading interface due to in-plane curvature, while \( \delta \) measures the strength of roughening caused by random aperture variations, and it is the competition between these mechanisms that controls phase geometry. For \( C/\delta \) well below 1, out-of-plane, aperture-induced curvature dominates, and the phase structure corresponds to IP within a spatially correlated field. As \( C/\delta \) increases, capillary fingers widen to above the spatial correlation length, due to smoothing generated by in-plane curvature. For \( C/\delta \) well above 1, in-plane curvature dominates, and the interface behaves as though in a Hele-Shaw cell, with little or no entrapment of the defending phase (see Fig. 2). Correspondingly, the areal saturation \( S_f \) at saturation ranges from about 0.37 (\( C/\delta \approx 0 \)) to 1 (\( C/\delta \approx 1 \)). In the intermediate range of \( C/\delta \approx 1 \), Glass et al. [15] also observed a nonunique behavior of \( S_f \) at saturation with respect to wetting versus nonwetting fluid invasions. This nonunique behavior is due to asymmetry in competition between the smoothing and roughening mechanisms, which results from the asymmetric distribution of \( 1/a \).

A useful model for \( k_{rs} \), should adequately describe behavior across the wide array of entrapped phase structures corresponding to the full range of \( C/\delta \). Nicholl et al. [7] proposed a model for \( k_{rs} \) that identified four controlling parameters: a tortuosity factor \( \tau \), the areal saturation of the flowing phase, \( S_f \), and two parameters that quantify deviations in the mean and variance of the aperture field within the flowing phase from those in the entire fracture. They calculated values for each of these parameters for seven saturated phase structures, demonstrating that the tortuosity played the most significant role in determining \( k_{rs} \). However, they did not develop relationships for predicting the model parameters based on fracture and fluid properties. We present an improved and general model that uses concepts from continuum percolation theory to develop a relationship between \( k_{rs} \) and \( S_f \) and explore this relationship over a broad range of \( C/\delta \). Our model leads to general predictive relationships for \( k_{rs} \) in terms of fracture and fluid properties. It is important to emphasize the distinction between this relationship and the more commonly used relative permeability-saturation relationship in two-phase flows. The latter involves relative permeabilities at different saturation values corresponding to a single invasion process. In contrast, the \( k_{rs} - S_f \) relationship does not correspond to a single invasion process. It represents the variation of (saturated) relative permeability \( k_{rs} \) with the areal saturation at saturation \( S_f \), which is in turn controlled by \( C/\delta \), the true “independent variable” in this context. The model predictions agree well with computational estimates of relative permeability obtained using flow simulations in partially saturated fractures.

II. MODEL FOR \( k_{rs} \)

Our approach is similar to that of Nicholl et al. [7], who proposed a theoretical expression for relative permeability in a variable-aperture fracture by modifying a result for the effective transmissivity of a heterogeneous two-dimensional medium [16] to account for impermeable obstructions to the flowing phase [17]. These theoretical expressions are approximations to the true effective transmissivity, in that they invoke the local cubic law, which assumes that pressure gradients across the aperture are negligible. However, Nicholl et al. [7] found that the relative permeability predicted by flow simulations based on the local cubic law were within 10% of experimentally measured relative permeabilities. This is evidently because the relative influence of the entrapped phase on the flow structure is substantially larger than the relative differences between the flow structure predicted by the three-
dimensional Stokes equations versus the local cubic law. Though Nicholl et al. [7] measured \( k_{rs} \) in a range of different phase structures, their experimental phase structures were not generated by systematic phase invasions. In particular, their phase structures did not cover the entire range of \( C/\delta \) and thus did not present a complete picture of \( k_{rs} \).

For a saturated variable-aperture fracture, the effective transmissivity can be obtained using a perturbation analysis on the flow equation:

\[
\nabla \cdot [T(x,y) \nabla h(x,y)] = 0,
\]

where \( T(x,y) \) is the spatially variable transmissivity field and \( h \) refers to the head field. The local transmissivity based on the Reynolds equation is given by

\[
T(x,y) = \frac{a^2(x,y)g}{12v},
\]

where \( a(x,y) \) is the spatially variable aperture field, \( g \) is the gravitational acceleration, and \( v \) is the kinematic viscosity of the fluid. Without making any assumptions about the specific distribution of \( T(x,y) \) (except that it is positive), a perturbation analysis of Eq. (3) can be developed in terms of the small transmissivity variation \( T'/T \), where \( T \) is the mean transmissivity. The analysis begins from

\[
\nabla \cdot \left[ \langle T \rangle \left( 1 + \frac{T'}{T} \right) \nabla \left( \langle h \rangle + h' \right) \right] = 0.
\]

The effective transmissivity for saturated flow, denoted here by \( T_{sat} \), is then quantified based on the relationship for the mean flux in terms of the mean gradient:

\[
\langle q \rangle = -\langle T \nabla h \rangle = T_{sat} \langle -\nabla h \rangle.
\]

In the case of small perturbations \((\delta \ll 1)\), \( T'/T \approx 3a'/a \) to first order in the aperture variations \( a' \) and the effective transmissivity for saturated flow in isotropic random aperture fields can be shown to be

\[
T_{sat} = \frac{\langle a \rangle^3 g}{12v} (1 - 1.5\delta^2).
\]

Expression (6) can also be obtained by a two-dimensional extension of a Landau-Lifshitz [16] analysis of the effective conductivity of a heterogeneous medium, as discussed by Zimmerman and Bodvarsson [17]. In the case of a lognormal aperture distribution with isotropic spatial correlation, a similar small-perturbation analysis based on \( \ln(T) \) yields the result that the effective transmissivity is the geometric mean of the transmissivity field [18–20]. For this case, Eq. (6) is a consistent approximation to the geometric mean, to second order in \( \delta \).

For a partially saturated variable-aperture fracture, the effective transmissivity (denoted as \( T_p \)) can be represented by modifying Eq. (6) with an additional reduction factor due to the reduced area occupied by the flowing phase [7]:

\[
T_p = k_{rs} \frac{\langle a \rangle^3}{12} (1 - 1.5\delta^2).
\]

In Eq. (7), the subscript \( f \) refers to the flowing phase, so that \( \langle a \rangle \) and \( \delta \), respectively, represent the mean and coefficient of variation of apertures in the region occupied by the flowing phase. Note that the volumetric saturation of the flowing fluid is equal to \( S_f \langle a \rangle / \langle a \rangle \). The quantity \( k_{rs} \) in Eq. (7) represents the reduction of permeability obtained in a parallel-plate fracture (or, equivalently, a homogeneous medium) with impermeable obstructions, whose geometries are identical to those of the entrapped phase.

We define the relative permeability as the ratio of Eq. (7) to Eq. (6):

\[
k_{rs} = k_{rs} AB,
\]

such that the total flow through a saturated fracture is represented by \( Q = k_{rs} T_{sat} W (\nabla h) \), where \( W \) is the width of the fracture. In Eq. (8), \( A \) and \( B \) represent the influence of the relative change in the mean and coefficient of variation of the apertures occupied by the flowing phase from the corresponding values in a fully saturated fracture:

\[
A = \langle a \rangle^3 / \langle a \rangle^3, \quad B = (1 - 1.5\delta^2) / (1 - 1.5\delta^2).
\]

As shown in the next section, the strongest contribution to \( k_{rs} \) is from \( k_{rel} \), which is related to the entrapped phase geometry. The term \( A \) is next in order of importance and \( B \) has a very minor influence on \( k_{rs} \). We outline approaches for quantifying each of these terms below.

Systematic simulations of \( k_{rel} \) for a range of \( C/\delta \) (presented in Sec. III) demonstrate that the behavior of \( k_{rs} \) with respect to \( S_f \) is similar to that observed in continuum percolation problems (i.e., linear dependence on \( S_f \) near \( k_{rel} = 1 \) and power dependence on \( S_f \) near \( k_{rel} = 0 \)); thus, we invoke concepts from continuum percolation to quantify \( k_{rel} \). The typical continuum percolation problem considers percolation and conduction in a homogeneous medium with randomly positioned identical “holes” as the area fraction of the holes is varied. Thus the entrapped defending fluid phase at the saturated state in variable aperture fractures corresponds to the hole phase in continuum percolation. However, unlike in standard continuum percolation, the geometry of the entrapped phase here is irregular, and there is considerable variation in the size, shape, orientation and aspect ratios of individual entrapped regions [see Figs. 2(b)–2(e)]. The variation of conductivity with area fraction of the hole phase has been considered extensively for the case of holes with regular shapes, such as circles and ellipses, squares and rectangles, and needles [21–28]. In some studies of continuum percolation (e.g., [25]), mixtures of holes with different shapes and sizes have been considered, with the conclusion that a scaled percolation threshold \( x \), in [25] at which the conductivity goes to zero is almost invariant over a wide range of continuum percolation systems. Garboczi et al. [25] also proposed a universal conductivity curve for two-dimensional continuum percolation systems, involving the variable \( x \), which is related to the remaining area fraction \( p \) (same as our \( S_f \)) as \( p = \exp(-x A_b / L_c^2) \), where \( A_b \) is the area.
of a single “hole” and \( L_{\text{eff}} \) is a characteristic length defined based on the initial slope of the conductivity curve. Their universal conductivity curve is of the form

\[
k_{rs} = \left(1 - \frac{x^*}{x} \right) \left(1 + \frac{x^*}{x} + \alpha x^2 (x_i - x^*) \right)^2 \frac{x^2 x^*}{(1 + x/x_i)}.
\]

In Eq. (10), \( x^* \) refers to the critical value of \( x \) at which the conductivity goes to zero, \( x_i \) is a parameter defining the initial slope (\( k_{rs} \sim 1 - tx/x_i \) for \( x \) close to 0), \( \alpha (=0.7) \) is a fitting parameter, and \( t \) is the conductivity exponent (\( t=1.3 \) in two dimensions).

Direct extension of Eq. (10) to the problem at hand is complicated by two factors: the wide distribution of the area \( A_k \) associated with a single hole, evident from the phase structures shown in Fig. 2, and the nonlinear relationship between \( S_f \) and \( x \) that will lead to a complicated expression for \( k_{rs} \). We therefore considered a linearized relationship between \( S_f \) and \( x \), where \(-\ln(1-(1-S_f))=1-S_f \) is proportional to \( x \). This leads to relationships in terms of \( 1-S_f \), rather than \( x \); we note that Xia and Thorpe [24] also expressed their conductivity relationships in terms of \( 1-S_f \) (their \( c \)). To further simplify the expression for \( k_{rs} \), we dropped the last term in the numerator of Eq. (10), which also eliminates the fitting parameter \( \alpha \), and modified the denominator to obtain a linear behavior of the form \( k_{rs} \sim 1 - (1-S_f)/(1-S_f) \) for \( x \) close to 0, leading to
In Eq. (11), there are three parameters: \( S_r^* \) is the percolation threshold at which \( k_{rs} \) goes to zero, \( S_f \) is the point where the initial slope for a small area fraction of holes crosses the abscissa when extrapolated, and \( t \) is the conductivity exponent, which has a value close to 1.3 in two dimensions [22,25–28]. Both \( S_r^* \) and \( S_f \) depend on the aspect ratio of the holes in general [24,25]. Expression (11) is basically an interpolant that is consistent with critical behavior near the percolation threshold \( [k_{rs}(1-S_f^*)^{-t} + k_s(1-S_f^*)^{-t}] \) and linear behavior for \( S_f \) near 1 \( [k_{rs}(1-(1-S_f^*)/(1-S_f))^{-t}] \), two limits that are universally observed for continuum percolation [24,25,28]. Although Eq. (10) was not originally developed for problems involving a wide range of sizes, shapes, and orientations of the hole phase, results in the next section show that the modified form (11) describes the behavior of \( k_{rs} \) very well.

The secondary term in Eq. (8), \( A \), represents the influence of the relative change in mean aperture within the flowing phase. Thus we expect \( A > 1 \) for nonwetting fluid flow and \( A < 1 \) for wetting fluid flow. \( A \) is also expected to depend strongly on \( \delta \), particularly for small values of \( C \). For \( C=0 \) (IP in a correlated lattice), the fluid phase geometries do not vary with \( \delta \). However, because of selective occupancy of the aperture distribution, the mean aperture within the flowing phase, and thus \( A \), will be influenced by \( \delta \). For standard percolation (SP), the invading phase occupies apertures strictly in ascending (wetting) or descending (nonwetting) order, which allows development of an analytical expression for \( A \). However, this analytical expression does not provide satisfactory estimates of \( A \) for phase structures generated by MIP in two-dimensional variable-aperture fractures, where in-plane curvature effects lead to significant deviations from the assumption of sequential occupancy. Therefore, we propose an empirical relationship for \( A \) that is based on an analysis of aperture field statistics within the invading phase over a large number of invasion simulations (described in detail in the following section):

\[
A = 1 \pm b \delta (1 - S_f)^2,
\]

where \( b \) is a fitted parameter. The last term \( B \) in Eq. (8), which is a measure of the change in aperture variance from the saturated state to the satiated state, has a very minor influence, and thus we have not developed an analytical or empirical relationship to quantify the influence of \( B \) on \( k_{rs} \).

III. EVALUATION OF THE \( k_{rs} - S_f \) MODEL

To evaluate the effectiveness of the model for \( k_{rs} \) proposed in the previous section, for use over a wide range of aperture-field statistics and fluid properties, we simulated flow through fractures containing phase structures generated from MIP simulations by systematically varying \( C/\delta \) [15]. The aperture fields \((1024 \times 2048)\) used for the simulations were generated using a fast Fourier transform (FFT) algorithm, with a Gaussian aperture distribution and a power spectrum of the form

\[
G(k_x, k_y) \propto (1 + l^2 k_x^2 + l^2 k_y^2)^{-n},
\]

where \( k_x \) and \( k_y \) are the wave numbers corresponding to the \( x \) and \( y \) dimensions, \( n \) is an exponent in the range \( 1 \leq n \leq 2 \), and \( l \) is a cutoff length scale [29]. This general form of \( G(k_x, k_y) \) is widely accepted as a reasonable model for natural fractures where the apertures exhibit a self-affine structure with Hurst exponent, \( H=n-1 \) for \( |k| > l/1 \) and negligible correlation for \(|k| < l/1 \) [30]. The functional form of \( G \) in Eq. (13) yields a smooth transition from power-law behavior \((|k| > l/1)\) to the cutoff value \((|k| < l/1)\) that results in random fields with well-behaved covariance functions (i.e., no oscillations as occur with an abrupt cutoff). We chose \( l \) to yield \( \lambda = 5 \) grid blocks for fields with zero mean, variance of 1, and \( n = 1.3 \), where \( \lambda \) is defined as the separation distance at which the semivariogram reaches a value of \( \sigma^2 \) [1–1/\( \epsilon \)]. We generated six random fields and scaled each to yield fractures with \( \delta = 0.0625, 0.125 \), and 0.25, resulting in a total of 18 aperture-field realizations [Fig. 2(a)]. Higher values of \( \delta \) yielded contact areas where the aperture is zero, which introduced additional complications during phase invasion and will not be addressed here.

In each of the 18 aperture fields, Glass et al. [15] simulated wetting and nonwetting phase invasions using MIP for 14 values of \( C \) that began at 0, followed by 0.0021 with successive doubling up to 8.58, for a total of 504 simulations. The invading phase was supplied across the entire edge of one short side of the random field while the defending phase was allowed to leave the field through the other three sides. Defending phase trapping was implemented and the simulation ended when all sites were either filled with invading phase or entrapped defending phase. The results of the phase invasion simulations allow direct measurements of \( S_f \), \( A \), and \( B \), but estimating \( k_{rs} \) and \( k_{rs} \) requires flow simulations in the fractures.

We simulated flow within the satiated phase structures by solving a finite-difference representation of Eq. (3) in each aperture-phase distribution field. We specified no-flux boundary conditions at the interfaces between the flowing and entrapped phases, with uniform constant pressure boundaries along the two short edges of the fractures and no flow boundaries along the long edges. The ratio of the simulated flow rate in the satiated fracture to that in the saturated fracture provides an estimate of \( k_{rs} \) for a fracture occupied by a specific phase distribution. Similar computations in a hypothetical parallel-plate fracture with impermeable obstructions corresponding to the entrapped phase geometry led to estimates of \( k_{rs} \).

IV. RESULTS

The results of the flow simulations demonstrate the influence of the entrapped phase on flow through saturated fractures. Figures 2(b)–2(e) show stream lines through fractures at several values of \( C/\delta \) after both wetting and nonwetting invasions. For \( C/\delta = 0 \) [Fig. 2(b)], the flowing phase occupies a small fraction of the total area, and the complex entrapped-
phase structures result in large regions of flowing phase capturing very little of the total flow through the fracture. This is particularly evident in the center of the fracture where several large entrapped regions nearly block flow. As $C/\delta$ increases [Figs. 2(c) and 2(d)], the regions of entrapped defending phase become more compact, leading to a larger number of open flow paths through the center of the fracture, less tortuous streamlines, and increased $k_{rs}$. Fundamental differences in the entrapped phase result during wetting and nonwetting invasions due to the order in which apertures are filled along the invading interface. Figures 2(d) and 2(e) demonstrate that wetting and nonwetting invasions at the same values of $C$ and $\delta$ lead to different entrapped regions within the same aperture field. Furthermore, $S_f$ is larger for the wetting invasion than the nonwetting invasion, which leads to slightly more tortuous stream lines for the nonwetting invasion.

The distributions of the apertures occupied by the invading phase at satiation vary significantly for wetting versus nonwetting invasions (Fig. 3). For small values of $C/\delta$ there is little overlap between the distributions corresponding to the wetting and nonwetting invasions and they are almost symmetric about the mean aperture of the saturated fracture $\langle a \rangle = 0.02 \text{ cm}$. However, as $C/\delta$ increases, the amount of overlap increases as a result of enhanced interface smoothing during invasion. Also, at larger values of $C/\delta$, the distributions are no longer symmetric about $\langle a \rangle$. This asymmetry is due to the asymmetric distribution of $1/a$ that corresponds to a Gaussian distribution for $a$. Because aperture-induced capillary pressure, which influences phase invasion, is proportional to $1/a$, asymmetry in the $1/a$ distribution leads to different behavior along the invading interface for wetting and nonwetting invasions. With a symmetric distribution for $1/a$, the aperture distributions for wetting and nonwetting invasions should be symmetric about $\langle a \rangle$ for all values of $C$ and $\delta$.

To evaluate the ability of the model presented in Eq. (8) to predict $k_{rs}$, we calculated the relevant parameters obtained from the 504 flow simulations. To clarify presentation of the data, for each combination of $C$ and $\delta$ we show only the average parameter values from the 6 aperture-field realizations in the following plots. For each parameter, the standard deviation across the 6 realizations was no larger than 11% of the mean value and was typically less than 5%. This demonstrates that the influence of $C/\delta$ on these parameters is more significant than variability across realizations. Figure 4 shows $S_f$ plotted against $C/\delta$ and shows, as detailed by Glass et al. [15], that $S_f$ exhibits a unique relationship with $C/\delta$ for small values of $C/\delta$. At larger values of $\delta$ and $C/\delta$ above $\sim 0.5$, measured values of $S_f$ fan apart and then converge again at large values of $C/\delta$. Glass et al. [15] explained this envelope based on the asymmetry in competition between smoothing and roughening, which is related to the asymmetric distribution of $1/a$. Based on the relationship between $C/\delta$ and $S_f$ in Fig. 4 a relationship that effectively quantifies $k_{rs}$ as a function of $S_f$ may be further generalized to directly relate $k_{rs}$ to $C/\delta$.

The distribution of apertures occupied by the invading fluid during wetting and nonwetting invasions (Fig. 3) strongly influences measured values of $A$. In each aperture field-realization, $A$ was determined at each value of $\delta$ and $S_f$ by computing the mean aperture value from pixels occupied by the flowing phase. Figure 5 shows $A$ plotted against $S_f$ with the results of fitting Eq. (12) to the data. The asymmetry in the distributions of aperture occupied by the invading fluid for the wetting and nonwetting invasions (Fig. 3) results in different values for the fitted parameter $b$: for nonwetting invasions $b=4.59$ and for wetting invasions $b=3.98$. The fitted curves for the wetting invasions deviate slightly from the data for intermediate values of $S_f$, but fit the data well for small values of $S_f$ where $A$ has the largest influence on estimates of $k_{rs}$.

Figure 6 shows $k_{rs}$ plotted against $S_f$ for all values of $C/\delta$ and compares these results to Eq. (11), the proposed model...
of $k_{rs}(S_f)$, with values of $S_{Hf}=0.72$, $S_f^*=0.333$, and $t=1.3$. The model fits the simulated values of $k_{rs}$ quite well across the full range of $S_f$ and only slightly overestimates the simulated values in the range of 0.55 to 0.85. The value of 0.72 for the parameter $S_{Hf}$, which is related to the initial slope, was obtained based on a linear fit to simulated $k_{rs}$ near $S_f=1$. With $t=1.3$, $S_f^*=0.333$ adequately represents the behavior of the simulated $k_{rs}$ values for the smallest values of $S_f$. In continuum percolation theory, $S_f^*$ corresponds to the critical value at which $k_{rs}$ goes to zero and, in the context of satiated phase structures, represents an absolute lower bound for $S_f$ at satiation. All satiated phase structures must correspond to $S_f > S_f^*$; the lowest value observed in MIP simulations over numerous realizations of random aperture fields was 0.34 at the limit of $C/\delta=0$ (the mean value for $C/\delta =0$ over 36 realizations is 0.82). It is important to distinguish the above interpretation of $S_f^*$ from the value of $S_f$ at first breakthrough during MIP, which is as low as 0.23 for $C/\delta =0$ and around 0.8 at large values of $C/\delta$. It is interesting to note that the value of 0.333 for $S_f^*$ corresponds to the percolation threshold for continuum percolation with circular or square holes [21,25,31], although the actual geometry of the entrapped phase (see Fig. 1) is much more complicated, involving a wide range of sizes, shapes, orientations, and aspect ratios. Garboczi et al. [25] investigated the variation of percolation threshold in mixed systems with circles of two different diameters, needles with two different lengths, and circle-needle mixtures. Their results showed minor variations in the scaled percolation threshold about their proposed universal value. We are unaware of any systematic results for continuum percolation with a broad distribution of size, shape, and aspect ratios for the holes, for comparison with our estimate of $S_f$. This and the explanation for why Eq. (11) provides an excellent model for $k_{rs}$ despite the complexity of the entrapped phase structure appear to be interesting problems for further research.

Using Eqs. (11) and (12) to model $k_{rs}$ and $A$ over the range of $S_f$ and $\delta$ allows us to use Eq. (8) to estimate $k_{rs}$ over the full range of parameters. Figure 7 compares the simulated values of $k_{rs}$ to estimates using Eq. (8). The discrepancies between the simulated results and the modeled estimates of $k_{rs}$ increase with $\delta$, the largest of which are around a 25% difference between the modeled and simulated estimates of $k_{rs}$. The largest discrepancies occur for the wetting invasion at $\delta=0.25$ for $k_{rs}<0.05$ and for the nonwetting invasion at $\delta=0.25$ for $k_{rs}=0.19$. For smaller values of $\delta$, the discrepancies all fall well within the 20% bounds shown in Fig. 7.
V. SUMMARY

We have developed a model for predicting the satiated relative permeability across a broad range of entrapped phase structures in variable aperture fractures. These entrapped phase structures represent both wetting and nonwetting displacements over a full spectrum of possible Curvature numbers ($C$) and a comprehensive set of fracture aperture statistics ($\delta$). The resulting entrapped phase ranged from highly tortuous structures resulting from capillary fingering to compact smooth structures at large values of $C/\delta$. The satiated relative permeability ($k_{rs}$) was shown to depend on the product of $k_{Sat}$, which quantifies the influence of the phase geometry alone, with $A$, which accounts for the modification of the mean aperture due to the selective occupancy of the flowing phase.

Our model for the satiated relative permeability ($k_{rs}$) uses well-established ideas from continuum percolation theory to relate $k_{rs}$ with $S_f$. This generalized model for $k_{rs}$ exhibits a power function dependence on $S_f$ near $S_f^*$ (the percolation threshold) and linear behavior near $S_f=1$. The exponent in the power-function behavior at low $S_f$ is consistent with the universal conductivity exponent (1.3) for two-dimensional percolation systems. The influence of aperture distribution and the effect of wetting versus nonwetting invasions on the mean aperture in the flowing phase are quantified through the term $A$. We have proposed a robust empirical relationship for $A$ in terms of $S_f$ and $\delta$. As expected, $A$ is greater than 1 for the nonwetting case and less than 1 for the wetting case and deviations from 1 are amplified by $\delta$. Thus, for a given value of $S_f$, $k_{rs}$ will be larger for flow of a nonwetting fluid than for a wetting fluid, with the difference enhanced at small values of $S_f$ and large values of $\delta$.

Comparison of the semiempirical model for $k_{rs}$ to measurements of $k_{rs}$ resulting from flow simulations through six fracture realizations over a range of $C$ and $\delta$ demonstrates that the model predicts $k_{rs}$ quite well over the full range of parameters. It is somewhat surprising that the influence of the complex phase structures on permeability can be quantified as a function $S_f$, a simple measure of the phase structure. However, it is likely that efforts to model other processes, such as solute transport in the flowing phase [32] or entrapped phase dissolution [8], will require higher-order measures of the entrapped phase geometry. We note that the model relates $k_{rs}$ to $\delta$ and $S_f$, which in turn is fundamentally controlled by $C/\delta$ for the case of capillary-dominated displacements. Thus, for capillary-dominated displacements in a given fracture it is possible to estimate $k_{rs}$ directly if the fracture aperture statistics and contact angle at the interface (i.e., $C$, $\delta$, and $\alpha$) are known.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Funding for this work was provided by the Department of Energy’s Office of Basic Energy Sciences, Geosciences Program under Contract Nos. DE-FG03-96ER14590 (University of Colorado), DE-AC04-94AL85000 (Sandia National Laboratories), and W-7405-Eng-48 (Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory).